Prof. Rahul Pandharipande

## Solution 20

## Galois correspondence. Simple extensions

1. Let $f=X^{3}-2 \in \mathbb{Q}[X]$ and consider its splitting field $E$. Recall from Assignment 16 that $\operatorname{Gal}(E / \mathbb{Q}) \cong S_{3}$. Write down the lattice of subgroups of $S_{3}$ and the corresponding fixed fields. Which of those are normal?
Solution: The polynomial $f$ has roots $z_{1}=\sqrt[3]{2}, z_{2}=\sqrt[3]{2} \omega$ and $z_{3}=\sqrt[3]{2} \omega^{2}$, where $\omega=e^{\frac{2 \pi i}{3}}$. The identification $\operatorname{Gal}(E / \mathbb{Q}) \cong S_{3}$ is given by $\sigma\left(z_{i}\right)=z_{\sigma(i)}$ for $\sigma \in S_{3}$. One can determine the image of $\omega$ under $\sigma$ as

$$
\sigma(\omega)=\frac{\sigma\left(z_{2}\right)}{\sigma\left(z_{1}\right)}=\frac{z_{\sigma(2)}}{z_{\sigma(1)}}=\omega^{\sigma(2)-\sigma(1)}
$$

The subgroups of $S_{3}$ are given by $1, S_{3}$ itself, $A_{3}=\left\langle\left(\begin{array}{ll}1 & 2\end{array}\right)\right\rangle$ and the three nonnormal subgroups $H_{i}=\langle(j k)\rangle$ for each choice of $\{i, j, k\}=\{1,2,3\}$. The only containments are given by $1 \leqslant H_{i} \leqslant S_{3}$ and $1 \leqslant A_{3} \unlhd S_{3}$. Denoting by $E^{G}$ the fixed field of $G$, we have


By construction, we see that $H_{i}$ fixes $z_{i}$ for each $i \in\{1,2,3\}$, so that $\mathbb{Q}\left(z_{i}\right) \subset E^{H_{i}}$. Since $\left[E: \mathbb{Q}\left(z_{i}\right)\right]=2=\left|H_{i}\right|=\left[E: E^{H_{i}}\right]$, we conclude that $E^{H_{i}}=\mathbb{Q}\left(z_{i}\right)$.
By Galois correspondence, $E^{A_{3}} / \mathbb{Q}$ is the only intermediate extension which is Galois, and it is also the unique extension of degree 2 . Since $\mathbb{Q}(\omega) / \mathbb{Q}$ is a quadratic field extension (the minimal polynomial of $\omega$ being $X^{2}+X+1 \in \mathbb{Q}[X]$ ) and $\mathbb{Q}(\omega) \subset E$, we must have $E^{A_{3}}=\mathbb{Q}(\omega)$. Alternatively, one can directly check
that $A_{3}$ fixes $\omega$ and conclude by comparing the degrees of the extensions: For $\tau=\left(\begin{array}{ll}1 & 2\end{array}\right)$, a generator of $A_{3}$, we have

$$
\tau(\omega)=\omega^{\tau(2)-\tau(1)}=\omega^{3-2}=\omega
$$

2. Let $k$ be a field and $f \in k[X]$ a polynomial with distinct roots. Let $E$ be the splitting field of $f$ and enumerate the roots of $f$ by $z_{1}, \ldots, z_{n}$ to fix an embedding $\operatorname{Gal}(E / k) \subset S_{n}$. Define the discriminant of $f$ as

$$
D(f)=\prod_{i<j}\left(z_{i}-z_{j}\right)^{2}
$$

(a) Assume that $\operatorname{char}(k) \neq 2$. Prove that $D(f)$ is a square in $k$ if and only if $\operatorname{Gal}(E / k) \subset A_{n}$.
(b) Show that $\mathbb{F}_{4} / \mathbb{F}_{2}$ is a counterexample in characteristic 2 to the previous part.

## Solution:

(a) Let $\Delta(f)=\prod_{i<j}\left(z_{i}-z_{j}\right)$. The square roots of $D(f)$ in $E$ are given by $\pm \Delta(f)$, so $D(f)$ is a square in $k$ if and only if $\Delta(f) \in k$. For $\sigma \in \operatorname{Gal}(E / k)$, we have $\sigma(\Delta(f))=\operatorname{sgn}(\sigma) \Delta(f)$ (since the $z_{i}$ are distinct); hence $\Delta(f)$ is fixed by $\sigma$ if and only if $\sigma \in A_{n}$ (because char $(k) \neq 2$ ).
Since $E / k$ is Galois, $\Delta(f)$ lies in $k$ if and only if it is fixed by all $\sigma \in \operatorname{Gal}(E / k)$, which by what we just showed is equivalent to $\operatorname{Gal}(E / k) \subset A_{n}$.
(b) For $k=\mathbb{F}_{2}$ and $E=\mathbb{F}_{4}$, we have $\operatorname{Gal}(E / k)=S_{2}=\langle\sigma\rangle$, where $\sigma$ is the Frobenius automorphism of $\mathbb{F}_{4}$. We can write $E=k(\alpha)$ where $\alpha$ is a root of $f=X^{2}+X+1 \in k[X]$, and $E$ is a splitting field of $f$. The other root of $f$ is $\alpha+1$. Then $\Delta(f)=(\alpha+1)-\alpha=1 \in \mathbb{F}_{2}$, so that $D(f)$ is a square in $\mathbb{F}_{2}$, although $\operatorname{Gal}(E / k)$ is not contained in $A_{2}=1$.
3. Let $L / k$ be a finite field extension and fix an embedding $L \subset \bar{k}$.
(a) Show that there exists a minimal finite field extension $E / k$ containing $L$ which is the splitting field of some polynomial.
(b) Show that if $L / k$ is separable (i.e. the minimal polynomial over $k$ of any element in $L$ has distinct roots in $\bar{k}$ ), then $E / k$ is Galois. In this case, $E$ is called the Galois closure of $L / k$.

## Hint: Assignment 19, Exercise 3.

## Solution:

(a) Since $L / k$ is a finite extension, it is finitely generated. Write $L=k\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right)$ and for each $i=1, \ldots, n$ let $f_{i}$ be the minimal polynomial of $x_{i}$ over $k$. Let $E$ be the splitting field of the product $f=f_{1} \cdots f_{n}$. Then $E$ clearly contains $L$. By Assignment 19, Exercise 3(a), we know that any extension of $k$ which is the splitting field of some polynomial $g \in k[X]$ and contains $x_{i}$ must contain all roots of its minimal polynomial $f_{i}$ as well, so $E$ is minimal by construction.
(b) If $L / k$ is separable, then $E / k$ from Part (a) is the splitting field of a polynomial with distinct roots as shown in the proof of Part (b) of Exercise 3 in Assignment 19. Thus, again by that exercise, $E / k$ is Galois.
4. We say that a field extension $L / k$ is simple if there exists $x \in L$ such that $L=k(x)$. In this exercise we will prove the following result:
Lemma. A finite field extensions $L / k$ is simple if and only if there are finitely many intermediate field extensions $L / F / k$.
(a) Suppose $L=k(x)$ for some $x \in L$ and let $L / F / k$ be an intermediate extension. Let $f \in F[X]$ be the minimal polynomial of $x$ over $F$ and let $F_{0} \subset F$ be the extension of $k$ generated by the coefficients of $f$. Prove that $F=F_{0}$. Hint: Check that $F(x)=F_{0}(x)$ and compare degrees.
(b) Conclude that if $L / k$ is simple, then it contains only finitely many intermediate subextensions.
Hint: In Part (a), $f$ divides the minimal polynomial of $x$ over $k$.
(c) Let $k$ be an infinite field and $V$ a $k$-vector space. Suppose that $V_{1}, \ldots, V_{m}$ are finitely many proper subspaces of $V$. Prove by induction that $\bigcup_{i=1}^{m} V_{i} \neq V$.
(d) Suppose that a finite field extension $L / k$ contains only finitely many intermediate extensions. Prove that $L / k$ is simple.

## Solution:

(a) The polynomial $f$ is irreducible in $F[X]$, hence also in $F_{0}[X]$. This means that $[F(x): F]=\operatorname{deg}(f)=\left[F_{0}(x): F_{0}\right]$. But

$$
L=k(x) \subset F_{0}(x) \subset F(x) \subset L
$$

implies that $F_{0}(x)=F(x)$, so that

$$
\left[F: F_{0}\right]=\frac{\left[F(x): F_{0}\right]}{[F(x): F]}=\frac{\left[F_{0}(x): F_{0}\right]}{[F(x): F]}=1 .
$$

(b) By Part (a), if $L=k(x) / F / k$ is an intermediate extension, then $F$ is generated by the coefficients of the minimal polynomial $f$ of $x$ over $F$, which is a proper monic factor of the minimal polynomial $g$ of $x$ over $k$ in $L[X]$. Since $g$ has only finitely many proper monic factors, there are only finitely many intermediate extensions $L / F / k$.
(c) See Chambert-Loir, A Field Guide to Algebra, Lemma 3.3.4.
(d) Suppose that $k$ is finite. Then $L$ is finite, too. By Algebra I, we know that $L^{\times}$is a cyclic group, so that for $x$ a generator of $L^{\times}$, we know that $k(x)$ contains the whole $L^{\times}$, implying that $L=k(x)$.
Suppose that $k$ is an infinite field. By assumption, there are only finitely many intermediate extensions of $L / k$. In particular, there are only finitely many intermediate simple extensions $L_{1}, \ldots, L_{m} / k$. As each $u \in L$ lies in the simple extension $k(u)$, we know that $L=\cup_{i=1}^{m} L_{i}$. Then, by Part (c), we must have $L=L_{i}$ for some $i$, so $L / k$ is itself a simple extension.
5. (Primitive Element Theorem) Let $L / k$ be a finite separable field extension. Prove that there exists $x \in L$ such that $L=k(x)$, i.e. that $L$ is simple.
Hint: Use the preceding exercises.
Solution: By Exercise $3, L / k$ is contained in a finite Galois extension $E / k$. By the Galois correspondence, the intermediate field extensions of $E / k$ are in bijection with the subgroups of the finite group $\operatorname{Gal}(E / k)$, so there are only finitely many. This implies that $L / k$ also has only finitely many intermediate field extensions. By Exercise $4, L / k$ is a simple extension.
6. Prove that the field extension $\mathbb{F}_{p}(s, t) / \mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t^{p}\right)$, where $s$ and $t$ are formal variables, contains infinitely many intermediate extensions.
Hint: Use Exercise 4.
Solution: By Exercise 4, it suffices to prove that $\mathbb{F}_{p}(s, t) / \mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t^{p}\right)$ is not simple. We first compute the degree of this extension. We have a tower of field extensions $\mathbb{F}_{p}(s, t) / \mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t\right) / \mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t^{p}\right)$. Note that $\mathbb{F}_{p}(s, t)=\mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t\right)(s)$ and that $s$ is the unique root of the polynomial

$$
(X-s)^{p}=X^{p}-s^{p} \in \mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t\right)[X],
$$

which is irreducible because its monic proper factors in $\mathbb{F}_{p}(s, t)[X]$ have constant term not in $\mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t\right)$. Thus, we obtain $\left[\mathbb{F}_{p}(s, t): \mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t\right)\right]=p$. Similarly, we see that $\left[\mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t\right): \mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t^{p}\right)\right]=p$ because $X^{p}-t^{p}$ is the minimal polynomial of $t$ over $\mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t^{p}\right)$. All in all we obtain

$$
\left[\mathbb{F}_{p}(s, t): \mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t^{p}\right)\right]=\left[\mathbb{F}_{p}(s, t): \mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t\right)\right]\left[\mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t\right): \mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t^{p}\right)\right]=p^{2}
$$

Suppose by contradiction that $\mathbb{F}_{p}(s, t) / \mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t^{p}\right)$ is simple and let $f \in \mathbb{F}_{p}(s, t)$ be a generator, i.e. $\mathbb{F}_{p}(s, t)=\mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t^{p}\right)(f)$. The Frobenius map $x \mapsto x^{p}$ is a field endomorphism of $\mathbb{F}_{p}(s, t)$, which implies that $f^{p} \in \mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t^{p}\right)$. Thus, the minimal polynomial of $f$ over $\mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t^{p}\right)$ divides $X^{p}-f^{p} \in \mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t^{p}\right)[X]$, so

$$
p^{2}=\left[\mathbb{F}_{p}(s, t): \mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t^{p}\right)\right]=\left[\mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t^{p}\right)(f): \mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t^{p}\right)\right] \leqslant p,
$$

a contradiction. Hence $\mathbb{F}_{p}(s, t) / \mathbb{F}_{p}\left(s^{p}, t^{p}\right)$ is not simple.

